

Notornis, 23(1):79 (March, 1976)

Dr Olson has replied as follows:

In response to Mr Scarlett's letter I would point out that the lengths he gives for the two new elements attributed to "*Gallirallus hartreei*" fall well within the range of variation of *Gallinula (Tribonyx) hodgengi* (see Olson, *Nat. Mus. N.Z. Recs.* 1 (3): 66, table 1). Beyond this we are told that only certain unspecified "subtle differences" distinguish these two species. Yet Mr Scarlett places them in different genera! To accept *Gallirallus hartreei* as a valid species would appear to require faith; in this instance I do not count myself among the faithful.

STORRS L. OLSON

Smithsonian Institution  
Washington, D.C., U.S.A.  
12 March 1976