

Wilson Bull., 101(4), 1989, pp. 633–637

The original description and author of the genus *Dumetella* (Mimidae).—The “Cat Bird” of Mark Catesby (1731–1743), now known as the “Gray Catbird,” served as the type of the *Muscicapa carolinensis* of Linnaeus (1766). When the species was first segregated in its own monotypic genus (as opposed to *Mimus*), it received the name *Galeoscoptes* Cabanis (1850), under which it was widely known until 1907 as *Galeoscoptes carolinensis* (see Ridgway

1907). At that time, C. W. Richmond advised Witmer Stone that the name *Dumetella* had been applied to this species in 1837 by one "S.D.W." in a journal called *The Analyst*, and accordingly Stone (1907:193) proposed that *Dumetella* be substituted for *Galeoscoptes*. This change was adopted in the 3rd edition of the A.O.U. Check-list of North American Birds (A.O.U. 1910), and the North American catbird has been *Dumetella carolinensis* ever since. It is not certain, however, that even Stone saw the original reference, which may not have been consulted by any ornithologist since Richmond. Furthermore, *Dumetella* has always been attributed only to "S.D.W.," apparently with no successful attempt having been made to determine the author's identity. This struck me as such a curious and unacceptable lacuna in ornithological knowledge, especially regarding such a familiar bird, that I undertook to solve the mystery if possible.

The Analyst was a short-lived "journal of science, literature, natural history, and the fine arts" published in London from 1834 to 1840, at first monthly and then quarterly after July 1835 (Bolton 1897:33). As was the custom of the times, many of its contributors signed only their initials, pseudonyms, or pseudonymous initials. The original "description" of the genus *Dumetella* actually appears in the preamble to a paper entitled "The Fishes (Pisces) of Britain, Systematically Arranged" (S.D.W. 1837). In previous issues of *The Analyst* are several discourses on ornithological nomenclature and similar lists of British birds and mammals by the same author (S.D.W. 1835a, b, 1836a, b, c), in which S.D.W. is seen as a vigorous proponent of a system of nomenclature and orthography that even in his own time must have seemed highly idiosyncratic. Among S.D.W.'s basic tenets was that the genus be reflected in the English as well as the scientific name of an organism, a proposal that had already been advanced in *The Analyst* by one Neville Wood (N. Wood 1835a). As a result of his beliefs, S.D.W. made massive arbitrary changes not only in English names but in scientific names as well. Richmond (1908) listed all the new generic names of birds proposed in *The Analyst*, attributing them only to "S.D.W." (virtually all of these are junior synonyms). Previous to Richmond, at least one of S.D.W.'s generic names, *Densirostra*, was listed by Waterhouse (1889:64), who gives the author as "Wood," which provides us with our first clue.

Neville Wood (fl. 1835–1839) was the fourth son of Charles Thorold Wood (1777–1852), both of whom published books on ornithology in the period 1835–1836 (Mullens and Swann 1917:661–664). In the "Ornithological Guide," C. T. Wood (1836a) extracts practically the whole of one of S.D.W.'s treatises in *The Analyst* as answering to his own views of nomenclature. In "The Ornithologist's Text Book," Neville Wood (1836b:94) reviews some of the contributions of S.D.W. with the greatest approbation, and both authors are high in their praise of *The Analyst* as a journal. From the character and tone of their writing and the inference from Waterhouse, it is quite clear that S.D.W. is either Wood *père* or Wood *filis*.

Circumstantial evidence immediately favors the former, as Neville Wood signed his own name to contributions in *The Analyst* and refers to material by S.D.W. as though written by other than himself (e.g., N. Wood 1835b, 1836b). Furthermore, at one point C. T. Wood states that "I have altered the name of the hedge coalhood . . . (See *The Analyst*, Nos. xi. and xiii.)," where the articles in question are signed "S.D.W." (C. T. Wood 1836b:143). That S.D.W. is a pseudonym of Charles Thorold Wood is repeatedly corroborated in Neville Wood's *British Song Birds* (N. Wood 1836c). Here we find the names of several birds attributed directly to C. T. Wood, and in each case the reference cited is either "*Analyst* 13" or "*Analyst* 14," in which issues the names in question appeared only in the lists of British birds signed by S.D.W. The S.D.W. names attributed to C. T. Wood in N. Wood (1836c) are: Garden Thrush (*Turdus hortensis*), Sibilous Brakehopper (*Locustella sibilatrix*), Garden Tit (*Parus hortensis*), Alpine Annet (*Curruca collaris*), Pied Wagtail (*Motacilla maculosa*), and Pine Thickbill (*Densirostra enucleator*).

From this evidence, the identity of S.D.W. is certainly established, so that any further citation of the author of *Dumetella* should read: "S.D.W." = C. T. Wood.

What of the actual "description" of the genus *Dumetella*? Because the work has probably never been seen by systematists, I shall here quote a substantial portion of the paragraph in which the name *Dumetella* first appears, from which the reader may appreciate the eccentric flavor of the work and sense the spirit in which the name was advanced. Recall that all this appeared in a treatise on British fishes. "I have several corrections myself to make, as *Surnia* for *Nictea* [Wood consistently substituted 'i' for 'y' in scientific names], and *Aluco* for *Surnia* (see *errata*, vol. iv., page 350); *glandarius* for the Bee-eater was, of course, an oversight. Locustell is better than Brakehopper, which will do for *Dumetella felivox*,—the Cat Thrush of Latham. The best British name for the *Silvia* is Willet, an unexceptionable appellation. The Garden Willet (*Silvia melodia*, Blyth) is a familiar example. Siskin is preferable to Goldwing (see vol. iii., page 32). Mr. Blyth has proposed Alp for Coalhood (*Pirula*). Poppin is the name of a genus in the Parrot family; so that the *Cristoptilus* may be called by the common name Yaffel." (S.D.W. 1837:206).

At this point, the combination *Dumetella felivox* is not really identifiable, as no author is given for the specific name *felivox*, which for all one knows from the original reference could have been S.D.W.'s invention as well as *Dumetella*. Thus the genus may be identified only with "the Cat Thrush of Latham." But, as noted by both Stone (1907) and Richmond (1908), there is no "Cat Thrush" in Latham (1783), who calls the bird "Cat Flycatcher." There is no doubt as to the species that S.D.W. had in mind, as Stevens (1817:272) in his continuation of George Shaw's *General Zoology*, a work doubtless well known to Wood, refers to the North American catbird as the "Cat Thrush" and applies the name *Turdus felivox* Vieillot, 1807, to it. But the identity of S.D.W.'s *Dumetella* can actually be determined only by inferences from sources other than in the original reference to the genus. Although a case might be made that *Dumetella* is technically based on a non-existent type species and therefore was not validly proposed, it is not at all clear which, if any, of the rules of nomenclature could be invoked, so there is no compelling reason for pursuing such action.

Oberholser (1974), followed by Phillips (1986) and Steadman (1988), revived the generic name *Lucar* (Bartram 1791) to replace *Dumetella* on grounds of priority. Although Bartram was not a binominal author, his classification was binary, so his generic names would seemingly have as much validity as those of Brisson (1760), whose genera are in wide use today in ornithology. Nevertheless, all of the editions of Bartram's *Travels* have been suppressed for nomenclatural purposes by the International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature (Melville and Smith 1987). Thus if one accepts those powers of the ICZN, the name *Lucar* would not be available as an earlier replacement for *Dumetella*.

Acknowledgments.—I thank Leslie Overstreet and other staff of the Smithsonian Institution Libraries for assistance in tracking down some very obscure references. For reading and commenting on the manuscript I am grateful to R. C. Banks, M. Ralph Browning, K. C. Parkes, and D. W. Steadman.

LITERATURE CITED

- AMERICAN ORNITHOLOGISTS' UNION 1910. Check-list of North American birds. 3rd ed. American Ornithologists' Union, New York, New York.
- BARTRAM, W. 1791. *Travels through North and South Carolina, Georgia, East and West Florida*. James & Johnson, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania.
- BOLTON, H. C. 1897. A catalogue of scientific and technical periodicals. 1665–1895. *Smithsonian Misc. Coll.* 60:1–1247.
- BRISSON, M. J. 1760. *Ornithologia sive synopsis methodica*. Bauche, Paris, France.

- CABANIS, J. 1850. *Museum Heineanum*. J. R. Frantz, Halberstadt, Germany.
- CATESBY, M. 1731-1743. *The natural history of Carolina, Florida and the Bahama Islands*. 2 vols. London, England.
- LATHAM, J. 1783. *A general synopsis of birds*. Vol. 2, part 1. Leigh & Sotheby, London, England.
- LINNAEUS, C. 1766. *Systema Naturae*. 12th ed. Laurentii Salvii, Stockholm, Sweden.
- MELVILLE, R. V. AND J. D. D. SMITH, EDs. 1987. *Official lists and indexes of names and works in zoology*. International Trust for Zoological Nomenclature, London, England.
- MULLENS, W. H. AND H. K. SWANN. 1917. *A bibliography of British ornithology*. Macmillan and Co., London, England.
- OBERHOLSER, H. C. 1974. *The bird life of Texas*. Univ. Texas Press, Austin, Texas.
- PHILLIPS, A. R. 1986. *The known birds of North and Middle America*. Part 1. Published by the author, Denver, Colorado.
- RICHMOND, C. W. 1908. Generic names applied to birds during the years 1901 to 1905, inclusive, with further additions to Waterhouse's "Index Generum Avium." *Proc. U.S. Nat. Mus.* 35:583-655.
- RIDGWAY, R. 1907. *The birds of North and Middle America*. Part 4. *Bulletin of the United States National Museum*, 50.
- STEADMAN, D. W. 1988. Vertebrates from the Late Quaternary Hiscock Site, Genesee County, New York. Pp. 95-113 in *Late Pleistocene and early Holocene paleoecology and archeology of the eastern Great Lakes Region* (R. S. Laub, N. G. Miller, and D. W. Steadman, eds.). *Bull. Buffalo Soc. Nat. Sci.* 33.
- STEVENS, J. F. 1817. *General zoology*. Vol. 10, part 1. G. Wilkie et al., London, England.
- STONE, W. 1907. Some changes in the current generic names of North American birds. *Auk* 24:189-199.
- VIEILLOT, L. J. P. 1807. *Histoire naturelle des oiseaux de l'Amerique Septentrionale*. 2 vols. Desray, Paris, France.
- WATERHOUSE, F. H. 1889. *Index generum avium*. R. H. Porter, London, England.
- "S.D.W." [=C. T. Wood]. 1835a. Remarks on vernacular and scientific ornithological nomenclature. *Analyst* 2(11):305-307. [This contribution is signed "N.F." which was later explained as a printer's error (S.D.W. 1835b:34). In the copy examined (Library of Congress) someone has pencilled "Charles" before the "N.F.," possibly for Charles T. Wood.]
- . 1835b. Remarks conducive to the improvement of ornithological nomenclature. *Analyst* 3(13):26-35.
- . 1836a. *The birds of Britain, systematically arranged*. *Analyst* 3(14):197-217.
- . 1836b. *The mammals of Britain, systematically arranged*. *Analyst* 4(15):67-72.
- . 1836c. [Letter to the editor on ornithological nomenclature.] *Analyst* 3(16):115-119.
- . 1837. *The fishes (Pisces) of Britain, systematically arranged*. *Analyst* 4(18):204-215.
- WOOD, CHARLES THOROLD. 1836a. *The ornithological guide: in which are discussed several interesting points in ornithology*. Whittaker and Co., London, England.
- . 1836b. Remarks on the question of the propriety of altering established scientific names in natural history, should they be erroneous. *Magazine of Natural History [London's]* 9:138-144.
- WOOD, NEVILLE. 1835a. On making the English generic names of birds correspond to the Latin ones. *Analyst* 2(10):238-239.
- . 1835b. On the nomenclature of birds. *Analyst* 2(12):419-421.
- . 1836a. [Letter to the editor on ornithological nomenclature.] *Analyst* 3(16):109-111.

- . 1836b. *The ornithologist's text-book, being reviews of ornithological works; with an appendix, containing discussions on various topics of interest.* John W. Parker, London, England.
- . 1836c. *British song birds; being popular descriptions and anecdotes of the choristers of the groves.* John W. Parker, London, England.

STORRS L. OLSON, *Dept. Vertebrate Zoology, National Museum of Natural History, Smithsonian Institution, Washington, D.C. 20560. Received 30 Nov. 1988, accepted 21 Mar. 1989.*