MANGROVE ISOTOPIC (δ15N AND δ13C) FRACTIONATION ACROSS A NITROGEN VS. PHOSPHORUS LIMITATION GRADIENT

KAREN L. MCKEE,1 ILKA C. FELLER,2 MARIANNE POPP,3 AND WOLFGANG WANEK3

1National Wetlands Research Center, U.S. Geological Survey, 700 Cajundome Boulevard, Lafayette, Louisiana 70506 USA
2Smithsonian Environmental Research Center, P.O. Box 28, Edgewater, Maryland 21037 USA
3Institute of Plant Physiology, University of Vienna, Vienna, Austria

Abstract. Mangrove islands in Belize are characterized by a unique switching from nitrogen (N) to phosphorus (P) limitation to tree growth from shoreline to interior. Fertilization has previously shown that Rhizophora mangle (red mangrove) fringe trees (5–6 m tall) growing along the shoreline are N limited; dwarf trees (≤1.5 m tall) in the forest interior are P limited; and transition trees (2–4 m tall) are co-limited by both N and P. Growth patterns paralleled a landward decrease in soil flushing by tides and an increase in bioavailable N, but P availability remained consistently low across the gradient. Stable isotopic composition was measured in R. mangle leaves to aid in explaining this nutrient switching pattern and growth variation. Along control transects, leaf δ15N decreased from +0.10‰ (fringe) to −5.38‰ (dwarf). The δ15N of N-fertilized trees also varied spatially, but the values were consistently more negative (by ~3‰) compared to control trees. Spatial variation in δ15N values disappeared when the trees were fertilized with P, and values averaged +0.12‰, similar to that in control fringe trees. Neither variation in source inputs nor microbial fractionation could fully account for the observed patterns in δ15N. The results instead suggest that the lower δ15N values in transition and dwarf control trees were due to plant fractionation as a consequence of slower growth and lower N demand. P fertilization increased N demand and decreased fractionation. Although leaf δ13C was unaffected by fertilization, values increased from fringe (−28.6‰) to transition (−27.9‰) to dwarf (−26.4‰) zones, indicating spatial variation in environmental stresses affecting stomatal conductance or carboxylation. The results thus suggest an interaction of external supply, internal demand, and plant ability to acquire nutrients under different hydro-edaphic conditions that vary across this tree-height gradient. The findings not only aid in understanding mangrove discrimination of nitrogen and carbon isotopes, but also have implications for identifying nutrient loading and other stress conditions in coastal systems dominated by mangroves.

Key words: carbon isotope discrimination; height forms; mangrove, red; nitrogen isotope discrimination; nutrient limitation; Rhizophora mangle; stress tolerance.

INTRODUCTION

Variation in plant height and productivity across environmental gradients occurs in both marsh and mangrove ecosystems. Along the Atlantic coast, tall creekbank and short inland height forms of Spartina alterniflora are characteristic features of intertidal marshes (Mendelssohn 1979). At subtropical and tropical latitudes, mangrove wetlands also exhibit tree-height and productivity variation from tall, highly productive trees growing along shorelines or riverbanks to scrub or dwarf stands in interior forests (Lugo and Snedaker 1974, Koltes et al. 1998). An understanding of the determinants of primary productivity in marsh and mangrove ecosystems is important because of its relationship to productivity of coastal fisheries (Turner 1977, Primavera 1998). Work conducted in temperate salt marshes indicates that local variation in S. alterniflora growth is mainly controlled by abiotic factors, specifically the interaction of soil anoxia, soluble sulfide, and salinity with plant nitrogen (N) uptake and assimilation (Mendelssohn 1979, Morris 1984, Bradley and Morris 1990, Koch et al. 1990). Investigations into mechanisms controlling mangrove growth suggest that similar edaphic factors interact with plant physiological and morphological adaptations to limit growth across environmental gradients (Boto and Wellington 1984, Ball 1988, Feller 1995, McKee 1995).

In Belize, a complex gradient of stress factors (salinity, flooding, and nutrients) occurs across mangrove-dominated islands where Rhizophora mangle L. trees decrease in height from 5–6 m along the shoreline (fringe) to 1.5 m or less in interior dwarf stands (McKee 1995). Productivity, measured as leaf-fall rates, also decreases spatially: fringe = 700 g·m⁻²·yr⁻¹, transition = 450 g·m⁻²·yr⁻¹, scrub/dwarf = 280 g·m⁻²·yr⁻¹ (Koltes et al. 1998). The short stature and low productivity of scrub/dwarf trees cannot be attributed to immaturity, since stunted trees are >50 yr old (based on leaf scar counts and leaf production rates; Feller 1995). Feller...
Table 1. Summary of Rhizophora mangle growth responses (percentage increase in growth variable) in three zones (fringe, transition, and dwarf) to nutrient enrichment with either nitrogen (N) as urea or phosphorus (P) as P₂O₅ (from Feller et al. 2001).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nutrient</th>
<th>Shoot elongation</th>
<th>New leaf pairs</th>
<th>New shoots</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fringe</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>115</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P</td>
<td>NS</td>
<td>NS</td>
<td>NS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transition</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>889</td>
<td>165</td>
<td>900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P</td>
<td>1747</td>
<td>290</td>
<td>1200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dwarf</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>NS</td>
<td>NS</td>
<td>NS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P</td>
<td>2579</td>
<td>379</td>
<td>1100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes: Increase in growth (relative to controls that received no fertilizer) based on measurements conducted over a 6-month interval on replicate trees (n = 9 trees per treatment × zone combination); NS = no significant change from control.

KAREN L. MCKEE ET AL. Ecology, Vol. 83, No. 4

(1995) has also demonstrated that fertilization of dwarf trees with phosphorus (P) can completely reverse this growth limitation. The spatial decline in mangrove tree height does not appear to be due to decreased availability of P to support growth, however. Porewater concentrations of PO₄-P do not vary with distance from the shoreline, and NH₄-N increases (McKee 1993). The co-occurrence of other stressors (e.g., soil waterlogging or salinity) instead suggests that the nutrient limitation to mangroves in landward positions is secondary to other growth-limiting factors, as found for salt marshes (Mendelssohn 1979).

Fertilization of R. mangle trees across the entire gradient in Belize has further revealed a unique switching from N to P limitation of mangrove growth. Growth and tissue nutrient responses to fertilization are reported in detail elsewhere (Feller et al. 2001) and summarized in Table 1. Fringe trees responded to N (urea) addition, dwarf trees responded to P addition, and transition trees responded to both N and P (applied separately). Feller et al. hypothesized that this switch from N to P limitation could be due to spatial variation in (1) external supply of N relative to P, (2) soil nutrient transformations affecting relative availability of N and P, and/or (3) nonresource factors affecting plant nutrient uptake, assimilation, and/or translocation.

Stable isotope methodology provides a means to assess nutrient sources (Evans et al. 1996, Rolston et al. 1996, Handley and Scrimgeour 1997), biological transformations affecting nutrient availability (Nadelhoffer and Fry 1994, Nadelhoffer et al. 1996, Jordan et al. 1997), and effects of environmental conditions on plant metabolism and growth (Farquhar 1993, Montoya and McCarthy 1995, Yoneyama 1995). Some evidence from terrestrial plant communities suggests that increased N mineralization rates may lead to increased ¹⁵N contents in plant-available N pools and hence higher ¹³¹⁵N values in plants. For example, P fertilization of tussock tundra resulted in increased soil N availability and increased δ¹³N values in some plant species (Nadelhoffer et al. 1996). Work with mangroves has also demonstrated variation in N and C isotopic composition in association with environmental change (e.g., eutrophication [Fry et al. 2000] and increased salinity [Lin and Sternberg 1992a, b]). Fry et al. (2000) reported that δ¹⁵N signatures of R. mangle trees varied substantially across sites in south Florida (from −5‰ to +13‰), and concluded that this pattern could be due to variation in source δ¹⁵N (e.g., anthropogenic NO₃⁻ inputs) and/or to physiological fractionation by plants growing under different stress conditions. Lin and Sternberg (1992a, b), studying fringe and scrub R. mangle in south Florida, found a negative correlation between leaf carbon isotopes (δ¹³C) and tree height, and attributed the higher δ¹³C values in scrub trees to elevated salinity and consequent effects on stomatal conductance.

In this study, we compared δ¹⁵N and δ¹³C values of N- and P-fertilized trees with that of unfertilized trees in an effort to understand the mechanism(s) controlling growth limitations and nutrient switching by R. mangle across a tree-height gradient. The results provide insight into within-stand nutrient dynamics in these mangrove ecosystems and factors contributing to isotopic composition of mangrove tissues.

Materials and Methods

Site description

The study was conducted at Twin Cays, a peat-based, 92-ha archipelago of mangrove islands located in the Belizean Barrier Reef Complex. These intertidal islands are ~12 km from the mainland and receive no terrigenous inputs of freshwater or sediments. Twin Cays is dominated by Rhizophora mangle L. (red mangrove) and Avicennia germinans (L.) Stearn. (black mangrove) with scattered Laguncularia racemosa (L.) Gaertn. f. (white mangrove). A distinct vegetative pattern is a tree-height gradient that parallels other gradients, such as productivity and tidal fluctuation. A narrow fringe zone (5–20 m wide) of uniformly tall trees occurs in the low intertidal zone around the periphery of the islands. Tree height decreases landward through a transition zone (5–30 m wide) and a dwarf zone (10–30 m wide) in the island interior. Soil surface elevation also varies along this height gradient, with the transition zone being the highest and the dwarf zone being the lowest. Both fringe and dwarf zones are dominated by R. mangle, whereas the transition zone is a mixed stand of R. mangle, A. germinans, and L. racemosa. The fringe zone (canopy height = 4–7 m) is flooded and drained >700 times/yr. The transition zone (canopy height = 2–4 m) is flooded only during high spring tides and storms (<50 times/yr). The dwarf zone
(canopy height <2.0 m) is perennially flooded, except during unusually low tides.

Our use of the term “dwarf” does not imply a genetic subtype of R. mangle, but refers to trees \( \leq 1.5 \) m in height and is consistent with terminology used in previous work at this location (Feller 1995, Feller et al. 1999, 2001). These stunted trees are mature (i.e., reproductive), and leaf scar counts and leaf production rates indicate that they are >40 yr old (Feller 1995). The lack of a genetic or developmental component has been demonstrated by growing short and tall mangroves under common conditions (Lin and Sternberg 1999).

Experimental design

Three transects, 10 meters apart, were established at three different locations \((n = 9)\) at Twin Cays in January 1995. The transects were oriented perpendicular to the shoreline and traversed the tree-height gradient from shoreline to island interior. Transects were subdivided into three zones based on tree height, and three experimental trees were selected within each zone for a total of nine trees across each transect and a total of 81 trees overall. Each of three transects at each location was randomly assigned to a nutrient treatment (N, P, or control). Rhizophora mangle trees were each fertilized at 6-mo intervals with 300 g of N fertilizer as urea (45:0:0), or P fertilizer as PO\(_4^3-\) (0:45:0), as described in Feller (1995). Fertilizer was inserted into holes cored into the soil beneath the canopy edge of each tree, and the holes were plugged with peat. At control trees, the holes were cored and sealed, but no fertilizer was added.

Hydro-edaphic analyses

To characterize hydro-edaphic conditions across the tree-height gradient, water levels, soil redox potentials and porewater salinity, pH, and sulfide were measured adjacent to the experimental trees in January 1995, before initiation of fertilizer treatments, and again in January 1997 after two years of fertilizer treatment. Water level relative to the soil surface was measured at high and low tides in wells (7 cm in diameter \( \times \) 30 cm deep) to determine relative depths of inundation and soil flushing over a tidal cycle. Soil redox potentials at 1 cm and 15 cm depths were measured with bright platinum electrodes equilibrated for 30 min as described in McKee et al. (1988). Interstitial water was collected from a depth of 15 cm, and sulfide, pH, and salinity were determined as described previously (McKee et al. 1988).

In January 1998, after three years of fertilizer treatment, bioavailable N and P were assessed with ion-exchange resin bags (Lajtha 1988) placed near each experimental tree. In contrast with instantaneous measures of porewater or extractable N or P, determination of bioavailable N and P with resin bags provides an integrated index of NO\(_3^-\), NH\(_4^+\), and PO\(_4^3-\) concentrations, the delivery rate (i.e., by diffusion or mass flow), and plant uptake over a time interval. The bags were constructed of undyed, nylon mesh material (panty hose), filled with 4 g of a mixed-bed (H\(^+\)/OH\(-\) ) exchanger (16–50 mesh) and conditioned with 1 mol/L NaCl. After rinsing with deionized water, duplicate bags were inserted into 15-cm-deep holes at each sampling station and covered with a soil plug. After incubation in situ for 15 d, the bags were retrieved, desorbed with 0.5 mol/L HCl (PO\(_4^3-\) and NO\(_3^-\)) or 1 mol/L KCl (NH\(_4^+\)), and the extract analyzed with a LACH-AT system (Quikchem IV, Lachat Instruments, Milwaukee, Wisconsin, USA) for NH\(_4^+\), NO\(_3^-\), and PO\(_4^3-\). Unincubated resin bags were used as blanks.

Plant and peat analyses

Leaf samples for isotopic analysis were harvested from each of 81 experimental trees in January 1998. The youngest, fully mature green leaves were collected from a penapical stem position on first-order branches in the top of the canopy (sun leaves). Peat cores (5 cm in diameter \( \times \) 20 cm deep) were also collected from unenriched zones to determine isotopic composition of soil organic matter. Leaf and peat samples were frozen and then freeze dried within 48 h of collection. The stable isotope composition (\( \delta^{13}C \) and \( \delta^{15}N \) signatures) was determined at the Institute of Plant Physiology, University of Vienna, Austria. Samples were ground to a fine powder in a ball mill (Retsch MM2, Vienna, Austria) and analyzed by continuous-flow gas isotope ratio mass spectrometry. The elemental analyzer (EA 1110, CE Instrumenten, Milan, Italy) was interfaced via a ConFlo II device (Finnigan MAT, Bremen, Germany) to the gas isotope ratio mass spectrometer (Delta\(^{12}C\), Finnigan MAT, Bremen, Germany). The \( ^{13}C \) and \( ^{15}N \) abundances were calculated as follows:

\[
\delta^{13}C = \left( \frac{R_{\text{sample}}}{R_{\text{standard}}} - 1 \right) \times 1000 \% \text{ vs. V-PDB}
\]

\[
\delta^{15}N = \left( \frac{R_{\text{sample}}}{R_{\text{standard}}} - 1 \right) \times 1000 \% \text{ vs. at-air}
\]

where \( R \) is the ratio of \( ^{13}C:^{12}C \) and \( ^{15}N:^{14}N \), respectively. The standard deviation of repeated measurements of \( \delta^{13}C \) and \( \delta^{15}N \) values of a laboratory standard was calculated to be 0.10\%e vs. V-PDB and 0.15\%e vs. at-air, respectively. These abundances are referred to the following certified reference materials: Pee Dee Belemnite (PDB) and atmospheric dinitrogen (at-air).

Leaves were also collected from each tree for determination of N and P concentrations and leaf area. Leaf area was determined with a Li-Cor 3000 Portable Area Meter (Li-Cor, Lincoln, Nebraska, USA). Leaf samples were dried at 70°C in a convection oven and ground in a Wiley Mill to pass through a 0.38-mm (40-mesh) screen. Concentration of N was determined with a 2400 CHN Analyzer (Perkin-Elmer, Shelton, Connecticut, USA) at the Smithsonian Environmental Research Center, Edgewater, Maryland, USA. Concentration of P was determined after acid digestion by using.
an inductively coupled plasma (ICP) spectrometer at Analytical Services, Pennsylvania State University, State College, Pennsylvania, USA.

Statistical analyses

The plant isotope data were analyzed by an analysis of variance (ANOVA, fixed effects model) in which the grouping factors were fertilizer treatment (control, N, and P) and zone (fringe, transition, and dwarf). Environmental data were analyzed with a repeated-measures ANOVA (fixed-effects model) where the grouping factors were treatment, zone, and sampling date (January 1995 and 1997). Any data that did not meet the variance homogeneity or normality assumptions for ANOVA were given for comparison (from McKee 1993a).

RESULTS

Along experimental transects, the dwarf zone was inundated to a greater depth at high tide, and the water level remained above the soil surface over a diurnal tidal cycle compared to the fringe and transition zones where greater soil flushing occurred (Table 2). Soil physico-chemical factors associated with flooding (Eh and sulfide concentrations) also varied and reflected the greater inundation and infrequent soil flushing of the dwarf zone (Table 2). Salinity was significantly elevated in the transition and dwarf zones in January prior to fertilization (Table 2). Fertilization with N or P did not significantly alter salinity, pH, or Eh (data not shown), but N enrichment significantly increased sulfide concentrations in the fringe zone to 0.68 ± 0.11 mmol/L, compared to 0.08 ± 0.04 mmol/L and 0.07 ± 0.03 mmol/L along control and P-fertilized transects, respectively (date × treatment × zone interaction; $F_{4,126} = 2.399$, $P = 0.05$).

Bioavailable NH$_4$-N increased from the fringe to the dwarf zone, but NO$_3$-N and PO$_4$-P did not vary (Table 3). Concentrations of NO$_3$-N were frequently below detection limits, so values for NO$_3$-N and NH$_4$-N were added to compare N bioavailability (Fig. 1). Across control transects, the ratio of bioavailable N:P in fringe and transition zones was significantly lower than in the dwarf zone (1 df contrast: $t = 2.83$, $P = 0.01$; Fig. 1). Fertilization with N or P caused significant increases in bioavailability of NH$_4$-N or PO$_4$-P, respectively (Table 3). Compared to control transects with an N:P ratio of 17 (averaged over zone), fertilization with N increased the ratio to 23, whereas P addition decreased it to 5.0 ($F_{2,68} = 6.47$, $P = 0.001$; Fig. 1).

Stable isotope values ($\delta^{15}$N) of source inputs are summarized in Table 4. The $\delta^{15}$N values for mangrove peat were lower in the dwarf zone (1 df contrast; $P = 0.0159$) compared to the fringe and transition zones, which were not significantly different (Table 5). The $\delta^{13}$C values did not differ across zones and averaged $-26.5 \pm 0.16$ (Table 5). The C and N concentrations of peat averaged 310 mg/g and 13.7 mg/g, respectively, and showed slight differences across zones (Table 5). The C:N ratios of mangrove peat decreased from fringe and transition to dwarf zones, but the difference was not significant (Table 5).

Leaf $\delta^{15}$N values decreased across the control transect from $+0.1\%$ in the fringe to $-5.38\%$ in the dwarf zone (Fig. 2a). The $\delta^{15}$N signatures of N-fertilized trees also varied spatially, but the values were consistently

### Table 2: Summary of hydro-edaphic conditions measured at Twin Cays prior to fertilizer application across a Rhizophora mangle tree-height gradient.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Fringe</th>
<th>Transition</th>
<th>Dwarf</th>
<th>$P$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Water depth relative to soil surface (cm)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High tide</td>
<td>$+3.2 \pm 0.6$</td>
<td>$+2.8 \pm 0.6$</td>
<td>$+12.4 \pm 3.1$</td>
<td>0.0015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low tide</td>
<td>$-15.0 \pm 1.9$</td>
<td>$-8.1 \pm 2.0$</td>
<td>$+0.9 \pm 2.4$</td>
<td>&lt;0.0001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soil Eh (mV)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 cm depth</td>
<td>$50 \pm 15$</td>
<td>$61 \pm 16$</td>
<td>$-9 \pm 13$</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>($-20 \pm 20$)</td>
<td>($24 \pm 102$)</td>
<td>($-19 \pm 6$)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15 cm depth</td>
<td>$-17 \pm 11$</td>
<td>$-16 \pm 15$</td>
<td>$-80 \pm 11$</td>
<td>&lt;0.0001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>($-76 \pm 19$)</td>
<td>($-46 \pm 34$)</td>
<td>($-177 \pm 94$)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Porewater</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salinity (g/L)</td>
<td>$37 \pm 1$</td>
<td>$39 \pm 1$</td>
<td>$40 \pm 1$</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(34–39)</td>
<td>(37–67)</td>
<td>(35–39)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pH</td>
<td>$6.3 \pm 0.1$</td>
<td>$6.3 \pm 0.1$</td>
<td>$6.4 \pm 0.1$</td>
<td>0.0002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(6.5–6.6)</td>
<td>(6.0–6.7)</td>
<td>(6.6–6.9)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sulfide (mmol/L)</td>
<td>$0.36 \pm 0.05$</td>
<td>$0.43 \pm 0.06$</td>
<td>$0.73 \pm 0.10$</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.08–0.4)</td>
<td>(0.01–0.27)</td>
<td>(0.64–1.68)</td>
<td>0.0001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Notes:** Values are the mean (± 1 se; $n = 9$ for water depth and $n = 27$ for soil and porewater variables). Probability of $F$ test results of an ANOVA are given for main effect of zone (df = 2, 68). Seasonal ranges (in parentheses) of physico-chemical variables at Twin Cays are also given for comparison (from McKee 1993a).
more negative (from −3% to −8%) compared to the control trees in each respective zone (Fig. 2a). This spatial variation in δ15N values disappeared when the trees were fertilized with P; however, and averaged +0.12% across zones, similar to that of fringe control trees (Fig. 2a). There was a significant increase in δ15N values from the fringe (−28.4%) to transition (−27.5%) and dwarf (−26.5%) zones that varied little by fertilizer treatment (Fig. 2b).

Along the control transects, δ15N values showed a strong negative correlation with δ13C values (r = 0.84, F1,25 = 59.7870, P < 0.0001, y = −28.3027 − 0.3225x). There was also a negative correlation between δ15N and δ13C signatures along the N-fertilized transect (r = 0.71, F1,25 = 24.5018, P < 0.0001, y = −28.9467 − 0.2956x). However P fertilizer dramatically altered the relationship between δ15N and δ13C (r = 0.28, F1,25 = 2.2613, P = 0.1452, y = −27.7967 − 0.2850x). Leaf δ15N values showed a strong negative correlation with leaf N:P (r = 0.968, F = 103.99, P < 0.0001; y = −13.55 + 195.91/x; Fig. 3). There was a significant positive correlation between leaf δ13C values and leaf N on a unit area basis (r = 0.877, F = 23.47, P = 0.0019; y = −23.049 − 1.001x; Fig. 4). Leaf P (but not leaf N) was negatively correlated with water depth at low tide (r = 0.707, F = 7.00, P = 0.0331; 1/y = 2.35 + 0.039y; Fig. 5).

### Discussion

#### Hydro-edaphic conditions

Consistent with previous findings (McKee 1993, 1995), hydro-edaphic conditions varied across the tree-height gradient and indicated less soil flushing and lower redox status with accumulation of sulfide in the dwarf zone (Table 2). The higher salinity in transition and dwarf mangrove zones also reflects infrequent tidal flushing and accumulation of salts (Table 2). Other work conducted at these sites found higher salinity during the dry season (McKee 1993, 1995). Salinity in the transition zone may vary from sea strength to >80 g/L, whereas it fluctuates less in the fringe and dwarf zones and usually does not exceed 40–45 g/L.

Bioavailability of N increased relative to P across the gradient (Fig. 1, Table 3) and agreed with growth responses to fertilization (Table 1). Similarly, porewater NH4+ in salt marshes may be ten times higher in less productive inland zones compared to streamside (Mendelssohn 1979). The higher NH4+ in interior

---

**Table 3. Summary of ANOVA results for bioavailable NO3-N, NH4-N, and PO4-P.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bioavailable nutrient</th>
<th>Zone</th>
<th>Treatment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mean (SE)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fringe</td>
<td>Transition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NO3-N</td>
<td>0.016 (0.008)</td>
<td>0.006 (0.003)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NH4-N</td>
<td>0.088 (0.025)</td>
<td>0.110 (0.028)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NO3− + NH4+</td>
<td>0.320 (0.025)</td>
<td>0.097 (0.027)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PO4-P</td>
<td>0.017 (0.003)</td>
<td>0.019 (0.006)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N:P</td>
<td>24 (6)</td>
<td>26 (7)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Note:** Nutrients were measured with resin bags implanted in fringe, transition, and dwarf zones and fertilizer treatments (μg [g resin]−1 d−1; mean ± 1 SE, n = 9).

* P ≤ 0.05, ** P ≤ 0.01.
marsh or mangrove zones could be the result of higher inputs (e.g., nitrogen fixation and litter mineralization), lower losses (e.g., denitrification), and/or decreased plant uptake (e.g., due to slower plant growth). Boto and Wellington (1984) also found a similar spatial variation in N:P that suggested N limitation to Australian mangroves at lower intertidal positions and P limitation at higher intertidal (inland) positions. In contrast to Twin Cays, however, P availability varied spatially in Australian mangal (Boto and Wellington 1983). This was possibly due to decreased inputs of mineral sediment with distance from the shoreline or to co-precipitation with Fe, a redox couple, (e.g., in more oxidized soils at higher elevations). Since the majority of P at Twin Cays likely occurs in organic form (peat soil with >75% organic matter) or as Ca-bound compounds (calcium carbonate sand), soil $E_p$ would not be expected to strongly influence P availability, as found in Australia.

Thus the tree-height gradient at Twin Cays was characterized by variation in soil waterlogging, salinity, and nutrient availability, analogous to that described for salt marshes where uptake and assimilation of N is limited by flooding-related stresses (Mendelssohn 1979, Morris 1984, Bradley and Morris 1990). However hydroedaphic patterns (Tables 2 and 3, Fig. 1), in combination with the nutrient-switching limitation to plant growth (Table 1), suggest a more complex interaction between availability of N and P and growth-limiting stress factors in these mangrove forests.

### Nitrogen isotope composition

The range of *R. mangle* leaf $\delta^{15}N$ measured across the tree-height gradient in Belize (Fig. 2) and in south Florida (Fry et al. 2000) was wider than that reported for some terrestrial plant species across greater spatial distances (±2.5%; Nadelhoffer et al. 1996). The broad range of values found for mangrove height forms in close proximity suggests strong spatial variation in processes controlling discrimination of N isotopes. Several factors may affect $\delta^{15}N$ signatures, including source of N, microbial processes that deplete or enrich $^{15}N$ in soil or water, and plant physiological processes that discriminate against $^{15}N$. The dramatic change in $\delta^{15}N$ values across the control transects suggests that one or more of these factors is important in determining the switch from N to P limitation.

The simplest explanation for spatial change in isotopic values is variation in source $^{15}N$. With increasing distance from the shoreline, the plants could be utilizing other sources with more negative signatures. Isotopic analyses by Ellison et al. (1996) suggest that fringing *R. mangle* trees at Twin Cays may acquire inorganic N from sponges encrusting the prop roots submerged in tidal creeks. The epibiont sources had signatures that varied from +5% to +6% (Table 4), and associated mangrove leaves exhibited $\delta^{15}N$ values between zero and +0.5% (Ellison et al. 1996), similar to our control fringe trees (Fig. 2). Another source of N is that fixed by nitrogen-fixing organisms such as cyanobacteria (Potts 1979). Fertilization with P may stimulate N fixation and increase foliar $\delta^{15}N$, as found for a tree species (*Metrosideros polymorpha*) growing on volcanic substrate (Vitousek 1999). Although variation in source N may have contributed to the observed isotopic patterns, this scenario by itself does not explain the spatial variation in tree height nor the switch

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Fringe</th>
<th>Transition</th>
<th>Dwarf</th>
<th>ANOVA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$\delta^{15}N$</td>
<td>+0.13 ± 0.25</td>
<td>+0.03 ± 0.07</td>
<td>−0.53 ± 0.05</td>
<td>5.625</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$\delta^{13}C$</td>
<td>−26.42 ± 0.14</td>
<td>−26.54 ± 0.08</td>
<td>−26.53 ± 0.08</td>
<td>0.3973</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N (mg/g)</td>
<td>13.7 ± 0.4</td>
<td>13.1 ± 0.1</td>
<td>14.2 ± 0.3</td>
<td>3.754</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C (mg/g)</td>
<td>322 ± 9</td>
<td>314 ± 9</td>
<td>293 ± 2</td>
<td>3.584</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C : N</td>
<td>27.5 ± 0.3</td>
<td>28.0 ± 0.7</td>
<td>24.0 ± 0.3</td>
<td>4.025</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Mean values are reported ± 1 se; $n = 3$.  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>N Source</th>
<th>$\delta^{15}N$</th>
<th>Reference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Oceanic NO$_3^-$</td>
<td>+4 to +7</td>
<td>Macko and Ostrom (1994)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fertilizer NO$_3^-$</td>
<td>−3 to +2</td>
<td>Rolston et al. (1996)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Animal waste</td>
<td>+9 to +25</td>
<td>Rolston et al. (1996)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soil organic N</td>
<td>+2 to +8</td>
<td>Rolston et al. (1996)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mangrove peat</td>
<td>−0.13</td>
<td>this study</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Root epibionts</td>
<td>+5 to +6</td>
<td>Ellison et al. (1996)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N fixation</td>
<td>−1 to +1.5</td>
<td>Carpenter et al. (1997)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urea fertilizer</td>
<td>−0.34</td>
<td>this study</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
from N to P limitation to mangrove growth across the gradient.

Leaf δ¹⁵N may also be altered indirectly by fractionation processes (microbial or plant). Fry et al. (2000) proposed two models to explain interactions of isotope source and processing to generate isotopic gradients across mangrove stands: (1) a source of low δ¹⁵N value with higher plant δ¹⁵N due to microbial fractionation of N isotopes, and (2) a source of high δ¹⁵N value with lower plant δ¹⁵N due to plant isotopic fractionation during N uptake. We consider these two models further in explaining the results at Twin Cays.

Microbial fractionation may cause enrichment with ¹⁵N due to losses of ¹⁵N-depleted nitrogen during denitrification or ammonia volatilization (Jordan et al. 1997). Coupled nitrification–denitrification may be greater in the fringe zone, where the soil is periodically flooded and drained by the tides. The dwarf zone, which is almost constantly submerged, may experience lower losses of N or uncoupled reactions. This model is consistent with the landward decline in soil flushing/aeration and leaf δ¹⁵N values across the control transect as well as the higher availability of NH₄⁺ near dwarf trees (Tables 2 and 3), but does not explain the effect of P fertilization (Fig. 2).

Plants may also discriminate against δ¹⁵N during uptake, assimilation, and/or translocation. Where N is limiting, all N is typically used regardless of isotope (Montoya and McCarthy 1995, Evans et al. 1996). Since the fringe trees are N limited (Table 1), they...
should use all sources of N, resulting in higher $\delta^{15}N$ values (Fig. 2). Increasing availability of N would result in greater fractionation and lower plant $\delta^{15}N$, as seen with increasing distance from the shoreline as well as in the N-fertilized trees (Fig. 2). Greater plant fractionation also occurs with NH$_4^+$ than with NO$_3^-$ (Yoneyama et al. 1991, Pennock et al. 1996), so that the decline in foliar $\delta^{15}N$ values with increasing distance from the shoreline might be due to variation in relative availability of these ions. Along the control transect, however, the bioavailability ratio of NO$_3^-$ to NH$_4^+$ did not vary between fringe and interior zones (1 df contrast: $t = -0.065, P > 0.10$). Enrichment with P did result in an increase in the relative availability of NO$_3^-$ to fringe trees (1 df contrast: $t = -3.43, P \leq 0.001$), but not dwarf and transition trees, a pattern inconsistent with the change in leaf $\delta^{15}N$ values.

Greater isotopic fractionation may also occur with slow plant growth because of low N demand (Goerick et al. 1994), and this pattern is consistent with the tree-height gradient. This plant fractionation model predicts that increased plant growth by addition of a growth-limiting nutrient other than N would increase N demand and decrease fractionation (because all N isotopes would be used). Enrichment with P, which enhanced growth and altered the nitrogen concentration of dwarf trees (Feller et al. 1999), was accompanied by an increase in leaf $\delta^{15}N$ values (Table 1, Fig. 2), consistent with model prediction. Greater resorption of P (73%) than N (47%) from senescing leaves indicates a higher demand for P by unfertilized dwarf trees (Feller et al. 1999). Furthermore, increased N use efficiency in response to P fertilization (61% increase, Feller et al. 1999) supports the explanation that N demand by R. mangle is increased by P addition. Finally, the strong correlation between leaf $\delta^{15}N$ and leaf N:P is consistent with this model (Fig. 3). Those trees with highest demand for N (fringe controls and all P-fertilized trees) occur at the upper extreme of this range where N isotope discrimination is lowest, and trees with lowest demand (N-fertilized dwarf trees) fall at the lower extreme where discrimination is greatest. Plant fractionation, as a consequence of plant growth and N demand, thus appears to be a likely mechanism contributing to the different $\delta^{15}N$ values among height forms of R. mangle at Twin Cays. The dramatic elimination of this pattern by P addition, coupled with growth stimulation, supports the hypothesis that decreased tree height and productivity across the gradient involves P deficiency. Kao and Chang (1998) came to a similar conclusion regarding dwarf Kandelia candel (i.e., growth restriction was at least partly due to nutrient deficiency, based on low tissue concentrations of N and P compared to taller trees).

However growth of P-limited dwarf trees was more severely restricted than fringe or transition trees (Table 1). Since bioavailability of P did not vary across the tree-height gradient (Table 3, Fig. 1), P acquisition or assimilation may be limited secondarily by another factor or growth may be limited directly by other stresses that increase with distance landward. The negative correlation between leaf P concentrations (but not leaf N) and water depth at low tide suggests a connection between soil flushing and P delivery or acquisition (Fig. 5). Factors such as soil waterlogging and salinity vary along with growth and tree stature across the gradient (Tables 1 and 2; see also McKee 1993, 1995), and these relationships are considered further in the following discussion.

Carbon isotope composition

The increase in leaf $\delta^{13}C$ values from the fringe to dwarf zones paralleled the decrease in tree growth across the tree-height gradient (Fig. 2b, Table 2). This isotopic pattern may be due to decreased stomatal conductance, which resulted in lower internal carbon dioxide concentrations and lower carbon isotope discrimination (Farquhar et al. 1982, Lin and Sternberg 1992a, b); increased carboxylation efficiency via higher leaf N concentration and/or lower specific leaf area (leaf area per mass; Körner et al. 1988); or higher internal resistance to CO$_2$ diffusion due to thicker leaves (Viousek et al. 1990, Lauteri et al. 1997).

The spatial pattern in C isotope discrimination was not significantly altered by nutrient addition (Fig. 2b). Some previous studies have also found no effect of fertilization on plant $\delta^{13}C$ (Lin and Sternberg 1992b, Michelsen et al. 1996), whereas others have (Guehl et al. 1995). Fertilization might cause opposing effects on the diffusive or enzymatic processes controlling C isotope discrimination and thus explain no change in $\delta^{13}C$ values. For example, fertilization of dwarf trees with P significantly reduces leaf thickness (Feller 1996), but
diffusive effects on δ13C might be counterbalanced by an increase in carboxylation efficiency in response to increased availability of P. However the more likely explanation for lack of a fertilizer effect is that the processes affecting C isotope discrimination in R. mangle were not directly affected by nutrients. The consistent spatial pattern across control and N- and P-fertilized transects lends support to this interpretation (Fig. 2b).

Lin and Sternberg (1992a) examined carbon isotopic distributions in R. mangle in south Florida and found a pattern of increasing δ13C signatures with decreasing tree height, similar to our study. Dwarf trees at Twin Cays (−26.5‰) had more negative δ13C values than stunted trees (1 m tall) in Florida (from −25‰ to −25.4‰), whereas fringe R. mangle trees growing at sea-strength salinity at Twin Cays (−28.4‰) had a similar C isotope ratio to that in Florida (from −28‰ to −29‰). The difference between dwarf trees in Florida and Belize cannot be attributed to climatic factors, since fringe trees would have also differed. Another explanation is that salinity in the dwarf zone at Twin Cays is, on average, lower or fluctuates less than that in Florida. Lin and Sternberg (1992b) further found that growing R. mangle and other mangrove species at constant, sea-strength salinity decreased C isotope discrimination, which correlated with lower intercellular CO2 concentrations and higher intrinsic transpiration efficiency. Plants grown in the greenhouse at 500 mmol/L NaCl (approximate concentration of seawater) had similar carbon isotope discrimination to fringe trees in the field, whereas that of plants grown at 100 mmol/L NaCl was −3‰ higher. In another greenhouse study, Lin and Sternberg (1993) found that fluctuating salinity (biweekly or monthly) decreased growth of red mangrove seedlings more than a constant high salinity. However salinity fluctuations reduced growth only when varied from zero to 200 mol/m³ and from 100 to 400 mol/m³, but not from 250 to 750 mol/m³ (from 18 to 53 g/L). The salinity range in dwarf stands at Twin Cays was from 38 to 45 g/L (McKee 1993), which is not only narrow but within the experimental range in which Lin and Sternberg (1993) found no effect of fluctuating salinity on growth. In fact, salinity was highest and fluctuated most in the transition zone (McKee 1993), but tree height and isotopic discrimination were intermediate to that in the fringe and dwarf zones (Fig. 2).

Thus δ13C values may increase in some situations as a consequence of elevated or fluctuating salinity that decreases stomatal conductance and intercellular CO2 (Lin and Sternberg 1992a, b, 1993), but this factor alone cannot explain the pattern at Twin Cays. An alternative hypothesis is that the δ13C pattern reflects spatial variation in some other factor influencing stomatal or carboxylation processes. In addition to salinity, stomatal conductance may also be decreased in mangroves by prolonged waterlogging, particularly in combination with saline conditions (Naidoo 1985). Since the tree-height gradient was characterized by variation in inundation (Table 2), greater soil waterlogging may have altered stomatal conductance or photosynthetic rates, affecting C isotope discrimination. Carboxylation efficiency may also be increased by higher leaf tissue N concentrations or lower specific leaf area (Körner et al. 1988). Cordell et al. (1999) found that less negative δ13C values were associated with increased carboxylation efficiency and leaf N on a per unit area basis in Metrocides polymorpha. The significant correlation between mangrove δ13C values and leaf N is consistent with this hypothesis (Fig. 3b). A final possibility is that leaf δ13C values simply reflect variation in environmental conditions caused by changes in tree height and canopy development. For example, water temperature, which is affected by canopy openness and solar radiation, can vary across the tree-height gradient from 28°C in the fringe to >40°C in the dwarf zone (K. L. McKee and I. C. Feller, personal observations) and could have influenced leaf δ13C values by decreasing stomatal conductance.

Conclusions

Although isotopic analyses cannot conclusively identify the factors contributing to growth variation in R. mangle, they suggest how nutrient switching may interact with other factors to limit growth. The results support two possible mechanisms that relate the known growth limiting factors at Twin Cays to explain observed patterns. Bioavailability of N relative to P increases with distance from shoreline, but growth is more restricted landward. There are two reasons for this conclusion.

1) Delivery, uptake, or assimilation of P is more strongly affected by tidal flushing and concomitant factors that vary spatially than is N. The greater growth response to P enrichment (Table 1) and the correlation between leaf P concentration and tidal fluctuation (Fig. 5) support this hypothesis. As water movement and mass flow through the soil are decreased with distance from the shoreline, P delivery to roots may become more diffusationally restricted than N due to differences in mobility of ions. Strongly adsorbed ions such as PO4,3- have diffusion coefficients as low as 10−9 cm²/s compared to NO3- and NH4+ (10−5 and 10−7 cm²/s, respectively; Nye and Tinker 1977). Mangrove growth consequently diminishes with distance from the shoreline because the total amount of P delivered to roots decreases even though concentrations do not vary. Soil waterlogging can also restrict root growth or metabolism of mangroves (McKee 1996), and these changes may affect uptake or assimilation of P more than N across the gradient. Examination of flooding and salinity effects on P vs. N acquisition by mangroves may help to resolve this issue.

2) Demand for P relative to N increases because stress effects differentially influence plant require-
ments for these nutrients. The alteration of N isotope fractionation by P addition to slow-growing plants and the correlation between leaf δ15N values and leaf N:P concentrations support the argument that the patterns reflect external nutrient availability relative to internal demand. Increased stress across the gradient may have increased the plant requirement for P relative to N. Leaf δ15N values indicated spatial variation in stress factors (independent of nutrient limitations) affecting stomatal conductance or carboxylation (Fig. 2), even though the analysis could not pinpoint which ones were involved in growth restriction. The effects of nutrient availability, flooding, and salinity need to be examined under controlled conditions and/or in conjunction with physiological measurements to fully interpret the effects of these stresses on mangrove growth, nutrient relations, and isotope discrimination.

This work aids in understanding the N to P limitation to mangrove growth across a tree-height gradient in Belize as well as environmental factors influencing mangrove discrimination of carbon and nitrogen isotopes. Our findings hint at the ecological complexity of these floristically simple ecosystems and illustrate the value of isotopic analysis in examining nutrient dynamics and stress responses by mangroves and other vegetation. The results also have implications for identifying nutrient loading in coastal systems dominated by mangroves. Fertilization with N and P clearly generates different isotopic compositions in mangrove tissues, but the pattern will depend on supplies of nutrients relative to internal demand and other environmental factors influencing nutrient acquisition. Additional work is needed to further refine these relationships, to identify those conditions that can alter isotopic distributions, and to clarify the plant processes controlling fractionation of N and C.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We thank K. Rützler and the Caribbean Coral Reef Ecosystems (CCRE) Program of the Smithsonian Institution for funding and use of the Carrie Bow Cay Field Station. This work was partially funded by a grant from the National Science Foundation’s Biocomplexity Program (DEB-9981483). We also thank P. Faulkner for laboratory assistance, and B. Fry, I. Mendelsohn, E. Proftt, B. Vairin, D. Johnson, and two anonymous reviewers for comments on the manuscript. This is CCRE contribution No. 612.

LITERATURE CITED


Koch, M., I. A. Mendelsohn, and K. L. McKee. 1990. Mechanism for the hydrogen sulfide-induced growth limitation...
in wetland macrophytes. Limnology and Oceanography 35:399–408.


