1987

More on the name Rallus hodgenorum

One must admire the determination with which Prof Mayr (Notornis 33: 268) exercises his penchant for misrepresenting issues relating to nomenclature. Because Scarlett named his rail simply "after Messrs J. and R. Hodgen, owners of Pyramid Valley swamp," all that can be inferred in any consideration of grammar is that two (J. and R.) masculine (Messrs) individuals with the surname Hodgen were to be honoured. There is no indication here that these gentlemen were brothers, were married, or that their presumed wives shared title to the swamp, none of which circumstances would alter the ending of the specific name of the bird in any event. The gratuitous interjection of such irrelevancies only lends an unbecoming air of frivolity to the discussion. Furthermore, because neither simplicity nor brevity is a criterion for determining nomenclatural usage, and no matter of priority is involved, these factors are likewise irrelevant. All that remains of Prof Mayr's argument then is his view that Article 31c of the Code of Nomenclature is "anachronistic." Nevertheless, Rallus hodgenorum is the correct form of the name if one intends to abide by the existing Code. Because compliance with the Code is strictly voluntary, those who wish to depart indefinitely from it need follow no rules and may use such names as please

As for Brachygalba lugubris naumburgi, a knowledgeable person encountering this name in the absence of the original description would

168 LETTER NOTORNIS 34

probably assume it to commemorate some male relative of Elsie's, or perhaps some other Naumburg family altogether. The correct spelling naumburgae not only helps to avoid this misapprehension, sets the historical record straight, and more properly honours the person to whom the bird was dedicated, but also is consistent in conforming with Latin grammar and thus with the Code as well. Considering these substantial benefits and the fact that there could be no possible confusion as to the taxon in question, I can see no harm whatever in making the correction. I wonder if Prof Mayr would be as indifferent towards grammatical carelessness if he were to be honoured with a new subspecies spelled mayrae.

STORRS L. OLSON, National Museum of Natural History, Smithsonian Institution, Washington, D.C. 20560